## Solutions to Exercises

## Chapter 3

**20** Show that  $\omega$  is transitive.

Solution. We prove by induction on n that for all  $n \in \omega$ ,  $n \subset \omega$ . For n = 0 this holds trivially. For  $n \in \omega$ , if  $n \subset \omega$ , then  $S(n) = n \cup \{n\} \subset \omega$ .

- **22.** Are the following (always) true?
  - 1. If every  $x \in A$  is transitive, then so is  $\bigcup A$ .
  - 2. If A is transitive, then so is  $\bigcup A$ .
  - 3. If  $\bigcup A$  is transitive, then so is A.
  - 4. If A is transitive, then so is  $\wp(A)$ .
  - 5. If  $\wp(A)$  is transitive, then so is A.

Solution.

- 1. True. If  $x \in y \in \bigcup A$ , then some  $z \in A$  exists s.t.  $y \in z$ . Since z is transitive,  $x \in z$ ; and so  $x \in \bigcup A$ .
- 2. True. If  $y \in \bigcup A$ , then some  $z \in A$  exists s.t.  $y \in z$ . Since A is transitive,  $y \in A$ , and so  $y \subset \bigcup A$ .
- 3. False. Consider  $A := \{\{\emptyset\}\}\$  (this is the simplest counter-example).
- 4. True. If  $x \in y \in \wp(A)$ , then  $y \subset A$  and  $x \in A$ . Since A is transitive,  $x \subset A$ , and so  $x \in \wp(A)$ .
- 5. True. If  $y \in A$ , then since  $A \in \wp(A)$  and  $\wp(A)$  is transitive,  $y \in \wp(A)$ . and so  $y \subset A$ .

**27** Show:  $\exists n \in \omega \Psi(n) \Rightarrow \exists n \in \omega [\Psi(n) \land \forall m < n \neg \Psi(m)].$ Solution. This statement is equivalent to  $\forall n [\forall m < n \neg \Psi(m) \Rightarrow \neg \Psi(n)] \Rightarrow \forall n \neg \Psi(n)$ , which is Strong Induction applied to  $\neg \Psi(n)$ .

**28** Define the property Z by:  $Z(x) \equiv_{\text{def}}$  there is no function f defined on  $\omega$  such that (i) f(0) = x and (ii) for all  $n \in \omega$ :  $f(n+1) \in f(n)$ . Show that the class  $\mathcal{Z} =_{\text{def}} \{x \mid Z(x)\}$  is not a set, and that for every set A:  $\{x \in A \mid Z(x)\} \notin A$ .

Solution. Both statements follow from the proposition that for any class C,  $\{x \in C \mid Z(x)\} \notin C$ . So let C be a class, and assume that  $X = \{x \in C \mid Z(x)\} \in C$ . Note that the property Z is such that  $\forall x[Z(x) \Leftrightarrow \forall y \in xZ(y)]$ . X is a set since  $X \in C$ , and therefore Z(X). It follows that  $X \in X$ . But then we can show that  $\neg Z(X)$  by defining f on  $\omega$  with f(n) = X for all n, a contradiction.

**33** Give an adequate definition of *natural number* that is not based on the Infinity Axiom.

Solution. The natural numbers are exactly the sets n such that for all X, if  $0 \in X$  and  $\forall m \in n (m \in X \implies S(m) \in X)$ , then  $n \in X$ . That the natural numbers satisfy this property follows from Exercise 32: that no other sets satisfy this property can be demonstrated by taking  $X = \omega$ .